# Analysis of Economics Data <br> Chapter 10: Data Summary with Multiple Regression 

(C) A. Colin Cameron<br>Univ. of Calif. Davis

October 2022

## CHAPTER 10: Data Summary with Multiple Regression

- Consider the relationship between house price and several variables
- size, number of bedrooms, ....
- Mostly a straight-forward extension of bivariate regression.
- New is:
- rely less on visual methods
- no easy formulas for estimates (without matrix algebra)
- adjusted $R^{2}$
- simultaneous tests of several hypotheses (in next chapter).


## Outline

(1) Example: House price and characteristics
(2) Two-way Scatter Plots
(3) Correlation
(C) Regression line
(3) Interpretation of Slope Coefficients
(6) Model Fit

- Computer Output Following Multiple Regression
(8) Inestimable Models


### 10.1 Example: House Price

- HOUSE data: 29 houses sold in central Davis, California, in 1999.
- lot size is 1 for small, 2 for medium and 3 for large
- a half bathroom is a lavatory without bath or shower.

|  |  | Standard |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Variable | Definition | Mean | deviation | Min | Max |
| Price | Sale Price in dollars | 253910 | 37391 | 204000 | 375000 |
| Size | House size in square feet | 1883 | 398 | 1400 | 3300 |
| Bedrooms | Number of bedrooms | 3.79 | 0.68 | 3 | 6 |
| Bathrooms | Number of bathrooms | 2.21 | 0.34 | 2 | 3 |
| Lotsize | Size of lot (1, 2 or 3) | 2.14 | 0.69 | 1 | 3 |
| Age | House age in years | 36.4 | 7.12 | 23 | 51 |
| Month Sold | Month of year house was sold | 5.97 | 1.68 | 3 | 8 |

## Example Regression

| Variable | Coefficient | St. Error | t statistic | p value | $95 \%$ conf. int. |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Size | 68.37 | 15.39 | 4.44 | 0.000 | 36.45 | 101.29 |
| Bedrooms | 2685 | 9193 | 0.29 | 0.773 | -16379 | 21749 |
| Bathrooms | 6833 | 15721 | 0.43 | 0.668 | -25771 | 39437 |
| Lot Size | 2303 | 7227 | 0.32 | 0.753 | -12684 | 17290 |
| Age | -833 | 719 | -1.16 | 0.259 | -2325 | 659 |
| Month Sold | -2089 | 3521 | -0.59 | 0.559 | -9390 | 5213 |
| Intercept | 137791 | 61464 | 2.24 | 0.036 | 10321 | 265261 |
| n | 29 |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\mathrm{~F}(6,22)$ | 6.83 |  |  |  |  |  |
| p-value for F | 0.0003 |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\mathrm{R}^{2}$ | 0.651 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Adjusted $\mathrm{R}^{2}$ | 0.555 |  |  |  |  |  |
| St. error | 24936 |  |  |  |  |  |

### 10.2 Two-way Scatterplots

- Can get multiple two-way scatterplots - next slide.
- Some programs provide three-way surface plots
- e.g. price against size and number of bedrooms
- these can be difficult to read.


## Two-way Scatterplots



### 10.3 Correlation

- Pairwise correlations are very useful for exploratory analysis
- Price is most highly correlated with square feet, then bedrooms and bathrooms.
- Asterisk means statistically significant correlation at significance level 0.05 .

| Correlation | Price | Size | Bed | Bath | Lot | Age | Mth Sold |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Sale Price | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Size | $.79^{*}$ | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bedrooms | $.43^{*}$ | $.52^{*}$ | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| Bathrooms | .33 | .32 | .04 | 1 |  |  |  |
| Lot Size | .15 | .11 | .29 | .10 | 1 |  |  |
| Age | -.07 | .08 | -.03 | .03 | -.02 | 1 |  |
| Month Sold | -.21 | -.21 | .18 | $-.39^{*}$ | -.06 | -.37 | 1 |

- Bedrooms correlated with Price but this could merely be picking up the effect of Size (Bedrooms is correlated with Size).
- Multiple regression measures role of each variable in predicting price, after controlling for the other variables.


### 10.4 Regression Line

- Regression line from regression of $y$ on several variables $x_{2}, \ldots, x_{k}$ is

$$
\widehat{y}=b_{1}+b_{2} x_{2}+b_{3} x_{3}+\cdots+b_{k} x_{k}
$$

where

- $\hat{y}=$ predicted (or fitted) dependent variable
- $x_{2}, \ldots, x_{k}$ are regressor variables
- $b_{1}, b_{2}, \ldots, b_{k}$ are estimated intercept and estimated slope parameters.


## Least Squares Estimation

- The residual is

$$
\begin{aligned}
e_{i} & =y_{i}-\widehat{y}_{i} \\
& =y_{i}-b_{1}-b_{2} x_{2 i}-b_{3} x_{3 i}+\cdots-b_{k} x_{k i} .
\end{aligned}
$$

- Estimate $b_{1}, b_{2}, \ldots, b_{k}$ by least squares (OLS: ordinary least squares) that minimizes sum of squared residuals

$$
\begin{aligned}
\sum_{i=1}^{n} e_{i}^{2} & =\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(y_{i}-\widehat{y}_{i}\right)^{2} \\
& =\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(y_{i}-b_{1}-b_{2} x_{2 i}-b_{3} x_{3 i}+\cdots-b_{k} x_{k i}\right)^{2}
\end{aligned}
$$

- Estimates $b_{1}, \ldots, b_{k}$ solve the $k$ normal equations
- $\sum_{i=1}^{n} x_{j i}\left(y_{i}-b_{1}-b_{2} x_{2 i}-b_{3} x_{3 i}-\cdots-b_{k} x_{k i}\right)=0, \quad j=1, \ldots, k$,
- or $\sum_{i=1}^{n} x_{j i} e_{i}=0, \quad j=1, \ldots, k$
- each regressor is orthogonal to the regressor
- and the residuals sum to zero if an intercept is included.


## Least Squares Estimates

- Consider the coefficient $b_{j}$ of the $j^{\text {th }}$ regressor $x_{j}$.
- The OLS coefficient $b_{j}$ can be calculated by
- bivariate regression of $y$ on $\widetilde{x}_{j}$
- where $\widetilde{x}_{j}=x_{j}-\widehat{x}_{j}$ is the residual from regressing $x_{j}$ on an intercept and all regressors other than $x_{j}$.
- Algebraically

$$
b_{j}=\frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n} \widetilde{x}_{j i}\left(y_{i}-\bar{y}\right)}{\sum_{i=1}^{n} \widetilde{x}_{j i}{ }^{2}} .
$$

- So OLS coefficient measures the relationship between $y$ and $x_{j}$ after the explanatory power of $x_{j}$ has been reduced by controlling for how the other regressors in the equation jointly predict $x_{j}$.
- More generally matrix algebra is used - see Appendix C.4.


### 10.5 Interpretation of Slope Coefficients

- $b_{2}$ measures the partial effect of changing $x_{2}$ while holding all other regressors at their current values
- Reason: increase $x_{2}$ by $\Delta x_{2}$. Then

$$
\begin{aligned}
\hat{y}_{\text {new }} & =b_{1}+b_{2}\left(x_{2}+\Delta x_{2}\right)+b_{3} x_{3}+\cdots+b_{k} x_{k} \\
& =b_{2} \Delta x_{2}+b_{1}+b_{2} x_{2}+b_{3} x_{3}+\cdots+b_{k} x_{k} \\
& =b_{2} \Delta x_{2}+\hat{y}_{\text {old }}
\end{aligned}
$$

- So $\Delta \widehat{y}=b_{2} \Delta x_{2}$ and hence partial effect

$$
\left.\frac{\Delta \widehat{y}}{\Delta x_{2}}\right|_{x_{3}, \ldots, x_{k}}=b_{2} .
$$

## Estimated Total Effect

- The total effect on $y_{2}$ lets other features of the house change as we change $x_{2}$.
- Suppose $\hat{y}=b_{1}+b_{2} x_{2}+b_{3} x_{3}$
- changing $x_{2}$ by $\Delta x_{2}$ is associated with a change in $x_{3}$ of $\Delta x_{3}$
- then the total effect on $y$ of changing $x_{2}$ by $\Delta x_{2}$ equals

$$
\Delta \widehat{y}=b_{2} \Delta x_{2}+b_{3} \Delta x_{3}
$$

- Dividing by $\Delta x_{2}$, the total effect on $y_{2}$ of changing $x_{2}$ equals

$$
\left.\frac{\Delta \widehat{y}}{\Delta x_{2}}\right|_{\text {Total }}=b_{2}+b_{3} \frac{\Delta x_{3}}{\Delta x_{2}}
$$

- Aside: Mechanical result for OLS
- When regression is by OLS, the total effect on the predicted value of $y$ when $x_{2}$ changes by one unit from a multivariate regression simply equals the slope coefficient from bivariate regression of $y$ on $x_{2}$ alone.


## Further Details

- Partial effect versus total effect
- Often interest lies in the partial effect of changing one key regressor after controlling for other variables
- e.g. size of change in earnings as education varies after controlling for age, gender, socioeconomic background.
- Calculus
- partial effect of regressor $x_{j}$ is partial derivative $\partial y / \partial x_{j}$.
- total effect of regressor $x_{j}$ is total derivative $d y / d x_{j}$.
- Causation
- OLS measures association but not necessarily causation.
- so say that a one unit change in $x_{j}$ is associated with a $b_{j}$ change in $\hat{y}$ holding all other regressors constant.


### 10.6 Model Fit: Standard Error of the Regression

- For multiple regression the standard error of the regression is

$$
s_{e}=\sqrt{\frac{1}{n-k} \sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(y_{i}-\widehat{y}_{i}\right)^{2}} .
$$

- Now division is by $n-k$, rather than $n-2$ in the bivariate case, as $k$ degrees of freedom are lost since computation of $\widehat{y}=b_{1}+b_{2} x+\cdots+b_{k} x_{k}$ is based on the $k$ estimates $b_{1}, \ldots ., b_{k}$.
- Another name for $s_{e}$ is the root mean squared error (MSE) of the residual.
- It is also sometimes called the standard error of the residual.


## R-Squared

- Again Total SS = Explained SS + Residual SS.
- R-squared is same underlying formula as in bivariate case

$$
\begin{aligned}
& R^{2}=\frac{\text { Explained SS }}{\text { Total SS }}=\frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(\widehat{y}_{i}-\bar{y}\right)^{2}}{\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(y_{i}-\bar{y}\right)^{2}} \\
& R^{2}=1-\frac{\text { Residual SS }}{\text { Total SS }}=1-\frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(y_{i}-\widehat{y}_{i}\right)^{2}}{\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(y_{i}-\bar{y}\right)^{2}} .
\end{aligned}
$$

- assuming the model includes an intercept term
- $0 \leq R^{2} \leq 1$.
- $R^{2}$ equals the fraction of the variation in $y$ (about $\bar{y}$ ) explained by the regressors $x_{1}, \ldots, x_{k}$.
- $R^{2}$ equals the squared correlation between $y_{i}$ and $\widehat{y}_{i}$
- i.e. between fitted and actual value of $y$.


## Adjusted R-Squared

- $R^{2}$ necessarily increases as add regressors, since residual sum of squares decreases.
- So also use adjusted R-squared, denoted $\bar{R}^{2}$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\bar{R}^{2} & =1-\frac{\text { Residual SS } /(n-k)}{\text { Total SS } /(n-1)} \\
& =1-\frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(y_{i}-\widehat{y}_{i}\right)^{2} /(n-k)}{\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(y_{i}-\bar{y}\right)^{2} /(n-1)} .
\end{aligned}
$$

- Motivation is to divide residual and total sum of squares by their degrees of freedom
- this gives penalty to larger models $(k \uparrow)$
- Compare smaller and larger model for house price
- with just square feet as regressor: $R^{2}=0.618$ and $\bar{R}^{2}=0.603$.
- with all regressors: $R^{2}=0.651$ and $\bar{R}^{2}=0.555$.
- only a modest increase in $R^{2}$ and $\bar{R}^{2}$ falls.


## Information Criteria

- Information criteria are a more advanced method that penalizes larger models.
- Specifically, information criteria penalize $\widehat{\sigma}_{e}^{2}$ for larger model size
- $\widehat{\sigma}_{e}^{2}=\frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(y_{i}-\widehat{y}_{i}\right)^{2}$ is the sample average of the squared residuals
- similar to $s_{e}^{2}$ except there is no degrees of freedom correction, so division is by $n$ rather than $n-k$.

Criteria
Akaike IC
Bayesian IC
Hannan-Quinn IC HQIC $=n \times \ln \widehat{\sigma}_{e}^{2}+n(1+\ln 2 \pi)+2 k \times \ln (\ln (n))$

- $k$ is the number of regressors
- smaller values of each criterion are preferred
- BIC is preferred (AIC has too small a penalty for model size)
- some statistical packages divide the above formulas by $n$.


### 10.7 Computer Output Following Multiple Regression

- Computer output usually has three components
- 1. ANOVA table
- Gives explained, residual and total sum of squares
- Use to compute R-squared (and overall F-statistic given in next chapter).
- 2. Regression coefficient estimates
- and associated standard errors, t-statistics, p-values, CI's
- 3. Regression summary statistics
- number of observations, R-squared, adjusted R-squared, Standard error of regression, overall F-statistic.


### 10.8 Inestimable Models

- It is not always possible to estimate all $k$ regression coefficients in the regression of $y$ on an intercept and regressors $x_{2}, \ldots, x_{k}$.
- e.g. bivariate regression cannot estimate $b_{2}$ if $\sum_{i=1}^{n}\left(x_{i}-\bar{x}\right)^{2}=0$.
- Then computer regression output will have no entries for one or more regressors, and may include the word omitted.
- When not all coefficients can be estimated
- the coefficients are said to be not identified
- the regressors are said to be perfectly collinear
- the regressor data matrix is said to of less than full rank.
- This situation may arise due to
- inadequate variation in the data in a well-specified model
- or due to a poorly specified model.


## Key Stata Commands

clear
use AED_HOUSE.DTA
correlate price size bedrooms bathroom lotsize age monthsold
regress price size bedrooms bathroom lotsize age monthsold

## Some in-class Exercises

(1) Regression leads to fitted line $\widehat{y}=2+3 x_{2}+4 x_{3}$. What is the residual for observation $\left(x_{2}, x_{3}, y\right)=(2,1,9)$ ?
(2) Suppose we know that $y=8+5 x_{2}+5 x_{3}+u$ where $E[u \mid x]=0$. Give the conditional mean of $y$ given $x$ and the error term for the observation $(x, y)=(2,3,30)$.
(3) OLS regression on the same dataset leads to fitted models $\widehat{y}=6+5 x_{2}$ and $\widehat{y}=2+3 x_{2}+4 x_{3}$. Are you surprised by the different coefficients for $x_{2}$ ? Explain.
(1) OLS regression of $y$ on $x$ for a sample of size 53 leads to residual sum of squares 20 and total sum of squares 50 . Compute the standard error of the regression.
(3) For the data of the previous example, compute $R^{2}$ and the correlation between $y$.and $\widehat{y}$.

